

PRESIDENT Tim Fox Montana Attorney General

> PRESIDENT-ELECT Karl A. Racine District of Columbia Attorney General

VICE PRESIDENT Tom Miller Iowa Attorney General

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT Jeff Landry Louisiana Attorney General

> EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR Chris Toth

1850 M Street, NW Twelfth Floor Washington, DC 20036 Phone: (202) 326-6000 https://www.naag.org/ June 16, 2020

Mr. Sundar Pichai Chief Executive Officer Google, LLC 1600 Amphitheatre Parkway Mountain View, CA 94043 Mr. Tim Cook Chief Executive Officer Apple, Inc. 1 Apple Park Way Cupertino, CA 95014

Dear Mr. Pichai and Mr. Cook:

The undersigned Attorneys General ("State Attorneys General") write to express our strong concerns regarding the proliferation of contact tracing apps on your platforms that do not sufficiently protect consumers' personal information. Digital contact tracing may provide a valuable tool to understand the spread of COVID-19 and assist the public health response to the pandemic. However, such technology also poses a risk to consumers' personally identifiable information, including sensitive health information, that could continue long after the present public health emergency ends.

We are aware of your companies' joint development of application programming interfaces (APIs) that may be used to build decentralized exposure notification and contact tracing apps that utilize Bluetooth. Additionally, we understand from press reports and online materials that those APIs will only be available to public health authorities and that use of the APIs will be contingent on the inclusion of certain features to protect consumer privacy.

While we welcome your stated focus on a privacy-centered notification and tracing tool for future use, several COVID-19 related contact tracing apps are already available on Google Play and the App Store. Some of those apps may endanger consumers' personal information. We are particularly concerned about purportedly "free" apps that utilize GPS tracking, contain advertisements and/or in-app purchases, and are not affiliated with any public health authority or legitimate research institution.¹

Moreover, as public health authorities release apps built with your APIs, there is likely to be increased media and consumer attention on exposure notification and contact tracing apps. Other developers may take advantage of the situation by placing new contact tracing apps on your platforms that do not adequately safeguard consumers' personal information

¹ For instance, as recently as early May, the first result when a consumer searches "contract tracing" on both platforms was an app called "Contact Tracing" developed by Piusworks, LLC, a California company with a suspended registration. According to the app information previously disclosed on Google Play, Contact Tracing uses geolocation tracking, contains ads, and offers in-app purchase, and it has been installed over 50,000 times. The app has since been removed from Google Play but is still available on the App Store.

in compliance with our states' laws. Therefore, we urge Google and Apple to take the following actions with respect to exposure notification and contact tracing apps available to U.S. consumers on Google Play and the App Store:

- 1. Verify that every app labeled or marketed as related to contact tracing, COVID-19 contact tracing, or coronavirus contact tracing or exposure notification is affiliated with a municipal, county, state or federal public health authority, or a hospital or university in the U.S. that is working with such public health authorities;
- 2. Remove any app that cannot be verified consistent with the above; and
- 3. Pledge to remove all COVID-19 / coronavirus related exposure notification and contact tracing apps, including those that utilize your new APIs, from Google Play and the App Store once the COVID-19 national emergency ends.² In addition, provide written confirmation to our offices that the apps have been removed or an explanation why removal of a particular app or apps would impair the public health authorities affiliated with each app.

Implementing these limited measures could help protect the personally identifiable information and sensitive health data of millions of consumers during this crisis.

Sincerely,

Douglas Peterson Nebraska Attorney General

ar

Kevin G. Clarkson Alaska Attorney General

Xavier Becerra California Attorney General

William Tong Connecticut Attorney General

Elu

Ellen F. Rosenblum Oregon Attorney General

Leslie Rutledge Arkansas Attorney General

Weiter

Phil Weiser Colorado Attorney General

athleen

Kathleen Jennings^U Delaware Attorney General

² This refers to the expiration of the emergency declared by the Secretary of Health and Human Services on January 31, 2020, under section 319 of the Public Health Service Act (42 U.S.C. 247d), and any renewals thereof.



Karl A. Racine District of Columbia Attorney General

Con E

Clare E. Connors Hawaii Attorney General

Kwame Raoul Illinois Attorney General

Tom Miller Iowa Attorney General

Jeff Landry Louisiana Attorney General

Brian Frosh Maryland Attorney General

ana

Dana Nessel Michigan Attorney General

Aaron D. Ford Nevada Attorney General



Gurbir S. Grewal New Jersey Attorney General

Leevin Taitano Camacho Guam Attorney General

 \sim

Lawrence Wasden Idaho Attorney General

F. Aaron Negangard Indiana Chief Deputy Attorney General

l'e

Derek Schmidt Kansas Attorney General

form M. Frey

Aaron M. Frey Maine Attorney General

Maura Healey Massachusetts Attorney General

Keith Ellison Minnesota Attorney General

Gordon MacDonald New Hampshire Attorney General

Hector Balderas New Mexico Attorney General

lah Stin

Josh Stein North Carolina Attorney General

or Got

Dave Yost Ohio Attorney General

Josh Shapiro Pennsylvania Attorney General

Peter F. Neronha Rhode Island Attorney General

Ken Paxton Texas Attorney General

T.J. Donovan Vermont Attorney General

PATRICK Momsey

Patrick Morrisey West Virginia Attorney General

ne opunnu

Wayne Stenehjem V North Dakota Attorney General

Mike Hunter Oklahoma Attorney General

Dennise N. Longo Quiñones Puerto Rico Attorney General

lating & Herbert H. Slatery III

Tennessee Attorney General

Sean Reyes Utah Attorney General

Nave R. Henny

Mark R. Herring Virginia Attorney General